

**Queen Ka'ahumanu MOA AMENDMENT 2 ATTACHMENT 2**  
**Consultation Summary in response to Stipulation 17, Post Review Discoveries**

106 Consultation	Date	Consulted Parties	Documentation
<b>APE AND SAIS</b>			
<p>Meeting to notify CPs of the site damage, buffer breaches and deficiencies in APE. Meeting included a site visit to damaged sites and buffer breaches</p>	<p align="center">12/6/2016</p>	<p><b>Attendees</b>            Cynthia Nazara, Kona HCC             Luana Keanaaina, Cultural Descendant            Kaliko Chun, Na Hoa Pili            Tyler Paikuli-Campbell, Kaloko-Honokohau NPS (KAHO)            Tammy Duchesne, KAHO, NPS            Bo Kahui, Lai Opua AHH            Aric Arakaki, Ala Kahakai National Historic Trail (AKNHT), NPS            Susan Lebo, SHPD            Rick Gmirkin, AKNHT            Fred Cachola, Makani Hou            Isaac "Paka" Harp, Makani Hou             Lisa Powell and Kaha'a Rezantes FHWA            Kaleo Salvador and Sterling Chow, HDOT            Julann Sonomura, HDOT            John Makoff, Ed Brown GBI            Billy Folk, Cory Simon, Hal Hammett, CSH            Roy Tsusui, Jason Tateishi RMTC            Robyn Ito and Austin Drake, SSFM</p>	<p>Meeting notes including sign-in sheet distributed via email and posted on project share site</p>
<p>Link to SAIS and expanded APE provided via email</p>	<p align="center">4/8/2017</p>	<p><b>Email Distribution List:</b>            Bo Kahui             Cynthia Nazara, Kona Hawaiian Civic Club            Fred Cachola, Makani Hou            Jeff Zimpfer, KAHO            Keola Lindsey, OHA            Kiersten Faulkner, HHF            Lauren Morowski, OHA            Susan Lebo, SHPD            Tyler Paikuli-Campbell, KAHO            Tammy Duchesne, NPS            Paka Harp, MHOKH            Kalani Nakoa, Nakoa Foundation            Kuauhaunui@gmail.com            Konakuauhau@gmail.com            William Thompson, NPS            Shane Nelson, OHA</p>	<p>email from Jason Tateishi</p>

<b>106 Consultation</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Consulted Parties</b>	<b>Documentation</b>
Invite to CP's on field visit to APE and request for information on sites or cultural knowledge	4/27/2017	<b>Email Distribution List:</b> Cynthia Nazara, Kona Hawaiian Civic Club Fred Cachola Jeff Zimpfer, KAHO Keola Lindsey, OHA Kiersten Faulkner, HHF Lauren Morowski, OHA Susan Lebo, SHPD Tyler Paikuli-Campbell, KAHO	email from Sterling Chow
CP Expanded APE site Visit	5/5/2017	<b>Attendees</b> Cynthia Nazara, Kona HCC Paka Harp through proxy, Cynthia Nazara Jacob Keanaaina, Cultural Monitor Amy Rubingh (SHPD, Hawaii Office) Deona Naboia, HDOT  Jason Tateishi RMT, Nate Garcia, Jacob	CP sign in sheet with listing of any known historic properties within the expanded APE  (none)
<b>Damage to Sites (92 LF of Mamalahoa Trail and 36 LF of Trail to Sea) and Buffer Breaches</b>			
Email notification of inadvertent damage to sites and buffer breaches	9/30/2016	<b>Email distribution list:</b> MOA Points of Contact	Email from Sterling Chow
Meeting to notify CPs of the site damage, buffer breaches and deficiencies in APE. Meeting included a site visit to damaged sites and buffer breaches	12/6/2016	Meeting Attendees Listed Above under APE/SAIS consultation	See above
Consultation Meeting on MOA Stipulations and consultation on damaged sites	4/7/2017	<b>Attendees</b> Fred Cachola, Makani Hou Isaac "Paka" Harp, Makani Hou Cynthia Nazara, Kona HCC Rick Grmirkin, AKNHT Jeff Zimpfer, KAHO, NPS Shane Nelson, OHA Lauren Morowski, OHA Scott Urada, Sterling Chow HDOT Natasha Soriano, HDOT Richelle Takara, Meesa Otani, FHWA Lisa Powell, FHWA Herb Lee, Dawn Chang, Facilitators Jason Tateishi, Laura Mau, Michelle Wong RMTC	Meeting notes including sign-in sheet distributed via email and posted on project share site Materials include: 2016 Annual Report MOA contact list Construction Status Maps of disturbed sites and buffers Final Action Plan

106 Consultation	Date	Consulted Parties	Documentation
<p>Consultation Meeting for damaged sites and CP proposals for mitigation. Makani Hou presented mitigation proposal which includes doing the following for Mamalahoa Trail, Trail to Sea, and Trail to Honokohau 1) Reconcile historic documentation and ownership 2)Commission cultural oral history survey 3)Restore and maintain the three trails 4)Plant Lolou palms to identify trails 5)Construct scenic overlook 6)Construct underpass Proposal #2 includes identify property owners, construct underpass, commission research study, artist, consult with Kapuna where the trails are located.</p>	<p>5/23/2017</p>	<p><b>Attendees</b>  Fred Cachola, Makani Hou, Royal Order of Kamehameha  Isaac "Paka" Harp, Makani Hou  Cynthia Nazara, Kona HCC  Keola Lindsey, OHA  Lauren Morowski, OHA  Rick Gmirkin, AKNHT, NPS  Susan Lebo, Amy Rubingh SHPD  Kiersten Faulkner, HHF  Bo Kahui, Laiopua HHA  Richelle Takara, Lisa Powell FHWA  Scot Urada, Sterling Chow, HDOT  Deona Naboia, HDOT  Jason Tateishi, Laura Mau, Michelle Wong RMTC  Dawn Chang, Herb Lee Facilitators</p>	<p>Meeting notes including sign-in sheet distributed via email and posted on project share site. Meeting notes and materials are also loaded on HDOT website. Materials include: Agenda, Finalized notes, Makani Hou proposal</p>
<p>Consultation Meeting to present HDOT Mitigation Option of restoring trails and trail education through Palamanui program, also discussed draft Amendment 1 and MOA Stipulations 4, 5b, 11, 17, 19, 21, 1, 2, 3, 6, 9, 10b, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16</p>	<p>6/26/2019</p>	<p><b>Attendees</b>  Mandy Ranslow (ACHP, by phone)  Lauren Morawski, OHA  Susand Lebo, SHPD  Tamara Luthy, SHPD  Fred Cachola, Makani Hou  Isaac "Paka" Harp, Makani Hou  Bo Kahui, Lai Opua HHA  Aric Arakaki, AKNHT  Mandy Johnson-Campbell, AKNHT  Kiersten Faulker, HHF  Jeff Zimpfer, KAHO, NPS  Carrie Johnson, OHA  Bill Thompson, KAHO, NPS  Lisa Powell, Meesa Otani FHWA  Kaha'a Rezantes FHWA  Don Smith, Pua Aiu HDOT  Herb Lee, Facilitator  Students and Faculty of Palamanui</p>	<p>Meeting notes including sign-in sheet distributed via email and posted on project share site   Also posted on HDOT Website.</p>

106 Consultation	Date	Consulted Parties	Documentation
<p>Consultation Meeting on MOA Stipulations, Amendments (there will be 2) and CP coalition proposal for mitigation. HDOT presented timeline and maps of damaged trails. CPs presented coalition proposal for Mamalahoa trail, Trail to Honokohau, and Road to the Sea trail Including 1) Reconcile historic trail documentation 2) Repair and stabilize trail 3) Oral History 4) Identify propoerty owners and facilitate meeting 4) Creation of comprehensive community trail plan 6) Mark trails with plants and art 7) Construct overlook 8) Map all ahupua'a boundaries and trails bisected 9) Install Underpass 10) HDOT hire expert historic preservation coordinator. FHWA questioned if the proposal was proportional to the damage to the 2 trails. CPs were asked if proposal parts could be prioritized. Makani Hou stated proposal was package and all parts are very important. HDOT stated they cannot commit to the entire proposal. FHWA stated that some components of the proposal could be funded but not all.</p>	<p>11/23/2019</p>	<p><b>Attendees</b></p> <p>Mandy Johnson-Campbell, AKNHT  Aric Arakaki, AKNHT  Fred Cachola, Makani Hou  Paka Harp, Makani Hou  Kekoa Nazara, Kona HCC  Lauren Morawki, OHA  Rick Gmirkin, AKNHT  Susan Lebo, SHPD  Jeff Zimpfer, KAHO, NPS  Mandy Ranslow, ACHP (via phone)  David Clark, FHWA (via phone)</p> <p>Richelle Takara and Lisa Powell, FHWA  Marshall Ando and Pua Aiu, HDOT  Julann Sonumura and Harry Takiue, HDOT  Faith Rex, Facilitator</p>	<p>Meeting notes including sign-in sheet distributed via email and posted on project share site</p> <p>Also posted on HDOT website.</p> <p><u>Materials include:</u>  Draft Amendment  Timeline</p> <p>Ala Kahakai materials  CP Mitigation  Proposal.</p>

106 Consultation	Date	Consulted Parties	Documentation
<p>Consultation Meeting to obtain feedback on Amendment 1 clause by clause. HDOT presented mitigation proposal of restoring 1000' of Mamalahoa Trail in HDOT ROW. FHWA stated the coalition proposal was a great vision, but beyond commensurate for the adverse effect for the trails damaged during construction. FHWA presented the Transportation Alternatives Program (TAP) as a possible way to fund the larger CP coalition proposal.</p>	<p>2/8/2020</p>	<p><b>Attendees</b>  Tanya Lizama, AKNHT  Amanda (Mandy) Johnson-Campbell, AKNHT  Lauren Morawski, OHA  Rick Gmirkin, AKNHT  Susan Lebo, SHPD  Isaac (Paka) Harp, Makani Hou  Fred Cachola, Makani Hou  Aric Arakaki, AKNHT  Kekoa Nazara, Kona HCC  Kiersten Faulkner, HHF  Jeff Zimpfer, KAHO  Mandy Ranslow, ACHP (via phone)  David Clark, FHWA (via phone)</p> <p>Richelle Takara and Lisa Powell, FHWA  Amy Ford-Wagner, FHWA  Marshall Ando and Pua Aiu, HDOT</p> <p>Julann Sonumura and Harry Takiue, HDOT  Faith Rex, Facilitator</p>	<p>Meeting notes including sign-in  Posted on HDOT website.  <u>Materials include:</u>  Meeting Notes  Agenda  Draft Amendment 1  APE Maps  Draft Amendment 2  Attach 1: Stip Status  Attach 2: List of trails and amount graded  Relationship Building Workshop report</p> <p>Annual report  Aug 13, 2019 MH  Objection &amp; FHWA/</p> <p>DOT Response  TAP Funding  Presentation</p>
<p>CP meeting on After Action Analysis, Proposed mitigation of breached sites. HDOT mitigation proposal includes restoring 1000 feet of Mamalahoa Trail.</p>	<p>4/4/2020</p>	<p><b>Attendees</b>  ACHP: Mandy Ranslow, ACHP  FHWA: David Clark, Lisa Powell, Richelle Takara,  HDOT: Marshall Ando, Harry Takiue, Pua Aiu, Julann Sonomura  HHF: Kiersten Faulkner  Kona HCC: Kekoa Nazara, Kona  Makani Hou: Fred Cachola  AKNHT: Aric Arakaki, Rick Gmirkin, Tanya Lizama</p> <p>OHA: Lauren Morawki  SHPD: Susan Lebo  SMS (Facilitator and notetaker): Faith Rex, Anna Pacheco</p>	<p>Meeting agenda,  Meeting notes,  <u>Materials include:</u>  Draft AAA-attached to agenda</p> <p>Table of Breaches  106 Workshops  Summary Report  Stipulation Status</p> <p>Table  Material available on HDOT website.</p>

106 Consultation	Date	Consulted Parties	Documentation
<p>CP meeting to discuss Mitigation for breached sites. Via Web chat room and conference call. HDOT mitigation proposal includes restoring 1000 LF of Mamalahoa Trail. Makani Hou and Na Ala Hele did not think the mitigation was commensurate to the adverse effect and thought the entire government property of the Mamalahoa trail should be restored and maintained. Makani Hou wanted entire coalition proposal funded. Makani Hou could not prioritize other parts of proposal over trail restoration.</p>	<p>4/16/2020</p>	<p><b>Attendees:</b>            FHWA: Richelle Takara, Meesa Otani, Kaha'a Rezentes, Lisa Powell            HDOT: Marshall Ando, Harry Takiue, Julann Sonomura, Pua Aiu            ACHP: Mandy Ranslow            Na Ala Hele: Jackson Bauer             AKNHT: Aric Arakaki, Tanya Lizama, Mandy Johnson-Campbell, Rick Gmirkin            OHA: Lauren Morowski            HHF: Kiersten Faulkner            MHOKHI: Fred Cachola, Paka Harp            Kona HCC: Kekoa Nazara             SMS: Faith Rex, Anna Pacheco</p>	<p>Agenda, Mitigation Proposal for Breached Sites, Draft Amendment 2, Table of breaches. Materials are posted to DOT website.</p>
<b>Amendment 1</b>			
<p>Consultation Meeting to present HDOT Mitigation Option, Amendment 1 and MOA Stipulation Status</p>	<p>6/26/2019</p>	<p>Listed above under Damage to Sites and Buffer Breaches</p>	<p>See Above</p>
<p>Consultation Meeting on MOA Stipulations, Amendments and CP proposal for mitigation</p>	<p>11/23/2019</p>	<p>Listed above under Damage to Sites and Buffer Breaches</p>	<p>See Above</p>
<p>Revised Amendment 1 sent via email to MOA POC List</p>	<p>1/15/2020</p>	<p><b>Email Distribution List:</b>            MOA Contact List</p>	<p>Email from Harry Takiue</p>
<p>Consultation Meeting regarding Amendment 1</p>	<p>2/8/2020</p>	<p>Listed above under Damage to Sites and Buffer Breaches</p>	<p>See Above</p>

106 Consultation	Date	Consulted Parties	Documentation
CP meeting on After Action Analysis, Proposed mitigation of breached sites	4/4/2020	<u>Attendees</u> ACHP: Mandy Ranslow, ACHP FHWA: David Clark, Lisa Powell, Richelle Takara, HDOT: Marshall Ando, Harry Takiue, Pua Aiu, Julann Sonomura HHF: Kiersten Faulkner Kona HCC: Kekoa Nazara, Kona Makani Hou: Fred Cachola AKNHT: Aric Arakaki, Rick Grmirkin, Tanya Lizama OHA: Lauren Morawki  SHPD: Susan Lebo SMS (Facilitator and notetaker): Faith Rex, Anna Pacheco	Meeting agenda, Meeting notes,  <u>Materials include:</u> Draft AAA-attached to agenda Table of Breaches 106 Workshops Summary Report  Stipulation Status Table Material available on HDOT website.
<b>Makani Hou Objection per Stipulation 18</b>			
Makani Hou submits objection to MOA implementation per Stipulation 18 regarding general consultation conduct, Stipulation 4, 5,8, 10b, 11, 12, 14, 15, 17, and 21	8/13/2019	Email from Fred Cachola, Makani Hou	
FHWA/HDOT response to Makani Hou Objection	8/21/2019	Email from Lisa Powell, FHWA	Available on HDOT website as part of Feb 29, 2020 Materials.
Meeting in person with Fred and Paka to resolve complaint.	10/25/2019	<u>Attendees:</u> Makani Hou-Fred Cachola, Paka Harp, FHWA-Lisa Powell, HDOT-Harry Takiue, Pua Aiu, SHPD-Susan Lebo, Sean Naleimaile	Meeting Notes: Sent out by Lisa Powell (FHWA). copy available on HDOT website.
CP meeting to discuss Objection (Via Google Hangouts, access provided by Paka Harp)	2/29/2020	<u>Attendees:</u> Makani Hou-Fred Cachola, Paka Harp, FHWA-Lisa Powell, Richelle Takara SHPD-Susan Lebo, HDOT-Harry Takiue, Julann Sonomura, Marshall Ando, Ken Tatsuguchi,	Finalized notes sent on April 1, 2020 by Lisa Powell. Available on HDOT website.

106 Consultation	Date	Consulted Parties	Documentation
CP Meeting to discuss status of stipulations in Makani Hou objection (close out memos); Update on AAA), via Web chatroom and phone.	5/29/2020	<p><b>Attendees:</b>  ACHP: Mandy Ranslow  FHWA: David Clark, Lisa Powell, Richelle Takara, Kaha'a Rezentos</p> <p>HDOT: Marshall Ando, Harry Takiue, Pua Aiu, Julann Sonomura, George Abcede  Na Ala Hele: Jackson Bauer  AKNHT: Rick Grmirkin, Tanya Lizama  HHF: Kiersten Faulkner  MH: Fred Cachola, Paka Harp  Kona HCC: Kekoa Nazara</p> <p>NHLC: Ashley Obrey (representing MH)  KAHO NPS: Jeff Zimpfer</p> <p>NPS: Malia Lane-Kamahele  SHPD: Susan Lebo</p> <p>SMS: Faith Rex, Anna Pacheco</p>	<p>Agenda  Meeting Notes  Close-out memos provided via links to</p> <p>HDOT site or RMT site:  Stip 4  Stip 8  Stip 10B  Stip 12  Stip 15</p> <p>Amendment 1, attachment 2  Attach 1: Stip Status</p> <p>Amend 2 Consultation Schedule</p>
Per Stipulation 18, FHWA determined objection could not be resolved and forwarded to ACHP for advice	7/8/2020	Letter from FHWA to ACHP	Letter distributed via email to CPs 7/14/2020 by Lisa Powell, FHWA
Per Stipulation 18, ACHP Responded with advice on objection	8/20/2020	Letter from ACHP to FHWA	Letter distributed via email to CPs 8/21/2020 by Lisa Powell, FHWA
Per Stipulation 18, FHWA provided final decision on objection. FHWA and HDOT will be developing NHO consultation protocols	9/2/2020	Letter from FHWA to ACHP	Letter distributed via email to CPs 9/4/2020 by Lisa Powell, FHWA



106 Consultation	Date	Consulted Parties	Documentation
Meeting held with CPs on ACHPs advice and FHWA response to the objection	9/24/2020	<b>Attendees:</b> FHWA: Meesa Otani, Lisa Powell, Ralph Rizzo, David Clarke HDOT: Harry Takiue, George Abcede, Julann Sonomura, Pua Aiu ACHP: Mandy Ranslow, Jamie Loichinger, Bill Dancingfeather SHPD: Susan Lebo Makani Hou: Fred Cachola, Paka Harp Native Hawaiian Legal Corporation: Ashley Obrey AKNHT: Rick Gmirkin, Amanda Johnson-Campbell OHA: Lauren Morawaski	Materials Posted Included three letters listed above and attachments to letters and agenda, Final notes distributed 10/16/2020 by Lisa Powell, FHWA
<b>Amendment 2</b>			
Draft Amendment 2 distributed via email includes extension of MOA by 5 years, and mitigation for damaged sites (preservation and restoration of 1,000 LF of Mamalahoa Trail in HDOT ROW)	2/4/2020	Draft Amendment 2 and attachments distributed to CPs	Email from Lisa Powell, FHWA
CP meeting to discuss Amendment 2 mitigation for breached sites. Via Web chat room and conference call.	2/8/2020	<b>Attendees:</b> Listed above under Damage to Sites and Buffer Breaches	See Above
CP meeting to discuss Mitigation for breached sites. Via Web chat room and conference call. (Further description of meeting listed above under Damage to Sites and Buffer Breaches)	4/16/2020	<b>Attendees:</b> Listed above under Damage to Sites and Buffer Breaches	See Above
CP meeting via webinar to discuss status of stipulations (Amendment 2 Attachment 1)	5/29/2020	<b>Attendees:</b> Listed Above under Makani Hou Objection Per Stipulation 18	See Above
Draft Amendment 2 and attachments distributed. Mitigation proposal extended to entire HDOT ROW-approximately 2500 LF	7/30/2020	Email from Harry Takiue, HDOT	Email included Draft Amendment 2 and Two Attachments

106 Consultation	Date	Consulted Parties	Documentation
<p>CP meeting held via webinar to give update on After Action Analysis and walk through draft Amendment 2 Clause by Clause</p>	<p>8/13/2020</p>	<p><b>Attendees:</b></p> <p>FHWA: Richelle Takara, Meesa Otani, Lisa Powell, David Clarke, Rob Ayers            HDOT: Harry Takiue, George Abcede, Julann Sonomura, Pua Aiu            ACHP: Mandy Ranslow            AKNHT: Rick Gmirkin, Amanda Johnson-Campbell            KAHO NPS: Jeff Zimpfer            OHA: Lauren Morowski            HHF: Kiersten Faulkner</p> <p>Makani Hou: Fred Cachola, Paka Harp            Native Hawaiian Legal Corporation: Ashley Obrey            Kona HCC: Kekoa Nazara            Volpe: Zoe McAlear, Rachel McBrian, Jessica Torossian            SMS: Faith Rex, Anna Pacheco</p>	<p>Materials Distributed included Draft Amendment 2, Amendment 2 Attachments and Agenda. Final notes distributed 9/15/2020 by HDOT</p>